

**ONLINE APPENDIX SUPPLEMENT  
to article in**

AMERICAN SOCIOLOGICAL REVIEW, 2004, VOL. 69 (OCTOBER:704-727)

**The Economic Incorporation of Immigrants in 18 Western  
Societies: Origin, Destination, and Community Effects**

Frank van Tubergen  
*Utrecht University, The Netherlands*

Ineke Maas  
*Utrecht University, The Netherlands*

Henk Flap  
*Utrecht University, The Netherlands*

## DATA SOURCES

- Australian Bureau of Statistics. 1981. *Australian Census 1981 Matrix Files—Table M048*. Canberra, Australia: Australian Social Science Data Archive [distributor].
- Australian Office of Multicultural Affairs. 1988. *Issues in Multicultural Australia*. Canberra, Australia: Australian Social Science Data Archive [distributor].
- Eurostat. 2002. *European Union Labour Force Survey, 1992–2001*. Luxembourg: Eurostat [distributor]. (Data available upon request.)
- Lesthaeghe, R. 1996. *MHSM Surveys Turkish and Moroccan Men in Belgium*. Brussels, Gent, Belgium: Vakgroep Sociaal Onderzoek, Vrije Universiteit Brussel; Vakgroep Bevolkingswetenschappen, Universiteit Gent [producer and distributor].
- Marplan. 1988. *Ausländer in Deutschland 1988*. Cologne, Germany: Zentralarchiv für Empirische Sozialforschung [distributor].
- Marplan. 1991. *Ausländer in Deutschland 1991*. Cologne, Germany: Zentralarchiv für Empirische Sozialforschung [distributor].
- Marplan. 1994. *Ausländer in Deutschland 1994*. Cologne, Germany: Zentralarchiv für Empirische Sozialforschung [distributor].
- Marplan. 1999. *Ausländer in Deutschland 1999*. Cologne, Germany: Zentralarchiv für Empirische Sozialforschung [distributor].
- Natale, M., G.C. Blangiardo, and A. Montanari. 1994. *La presenza straniera in Italia*. Rome, Italy: Dipartimento di Scienze Demografiche, l'università di Roma 'La Sapienza.' [producer and distributor].
- Natale, M., and S. Strozza. 1998. *Indagine statistica sulle caratteristiche e sul comportamento economico degli stranieri immigrati*. Italy: Dipartimento di Scienze Demografiche, l'università di Roma 'La Sapienza.' [producer and distributor].
- Smith, P., and G. Prior. 1994. *The Fourth National Survey of Ethnic Minorities 1993–94*. Colchester, England: UK Data Archive [distributor].
- Statistics Canada. 1991. *1991 Census Public Use Microdata File*. Ottawa, Canada: Statistics Canada [producer and distributor].
- Statistics Canada. 1996. *1996 Census Public Use Microdata File*. Ottawa, Canada: Statistics Canada [producer and distributor].
- United States Census Bureau. 1980. *1980 US Census 1 Percent Public Use Microdata Sample*. Ann Arbor, MI, USA: Interuniversity Consortium for Political and Social Research [distributor].
- United States Census Bureau. 1990. *1990 US Census 1 Percent Public Use Microdata Sample*. Ann Arbor, MI, USA: Interuniversity Consortium for Political and Social Research [distributor].
- Veenman, J. 1991. *Sociaal–economische Positie en Voorzieningsgebruik van Allochtonen en Autochtonen 1991*. Amsterdam, Netherlands: Steinmetz Archive [distributor].
- Veenman, J. 1994. *Sociaal–economische Positie en Voorzieningsgebruik van Allochtonen en Autochtonen 1994*. Amsterdam, Netherlands: Steinmetz Archive [distributor].

## DESCRIPTIVE DATA

**Table 1.** Number of Respondents in the Cross–National Data Set: Illustration of Five Selected Origin Groups

Destination	Country of Origin						Total
	Germany	Italy	Morocco	Turkey	United Kingdom	Other	
Australia	978	1,121	0	1,127	1,715	38,750	43,691
Austria	2,888	325	26	4,353	184	16,467	24,243
Belgium	2,227	5,452	5,949	4,114	685	14,513	32,940
Canada	1,732	1,947	0	0	1,812	18,855	24,346
Denmark	297	14	24	176	187	1,523	2,221
Finland	16	3	2	7	3	273	304
France	379	632	2,598	928	340	9,536	14,413
Germany	NA	2,009	88	3,572	187	12,169	18,025
Greece	954	68	9	472	181	7,574	9,258
Ireland	400	192	2	0	9,916	1,990	12,500
Italy	68	NA	1,229	3	55	3,378	4,733
Luxembourg	1,451	1,826	56	34	470	14,666	18,503
Netherlands	1,950	303	3,870	4,792	1,023	11,201	23,139
Portugal	129	30	13	1	53	1,633	1,859
Spain	309	163	873	8	428	2,132	3,913
Sweden	119	24	17	172	85	3,110	3,527
United Kingdom	2,202	764	154	430	NA	26,467	30,017
United States	1,630	1,357	208	426	1,654	75,084	80,359
Total	17,729	16,230	15,118	20,615	18,978	259,321	347,991

**Table 2.** Descriptive Statistics of Variables

	Males			Females		
	Range	Mean	SD	Range	Mean	SD
<b>Destination Variables</b>						
Point system	0/1	0.03	0.17	0/1	0.03	0.17
Left-wing parties in government	0-10	4.50	2.75	0-10	4.52	2.76
<b>Origin variables</b>						
Political suppression	2-14	8.33	3.86	2-14	8.13	3.85
Christian origin	0/1	0.43	0.50	0/1	0.40	0.49
Labor-force participation females, origin				6-97	48.29	20.03
<b>Community variables</b>						
Gini ratio						
(origin/destination)	0.57-2.57	1.16	0.34	0.57-2.57	1.16	0.34
GDP per capita ratio						
(origin / destination)	0.01-5.66	0.59	0.71	0.01-5.66	0.60	0.72
Geographic distance						
(per 1000 km)	0.17-19.84	5.57	4.75	0.17-18.97	5.52	4.71
Official language	0/1	0.16	0.36	0/1	0.16	0.37
Relative group size (%)	0-9.71	0.14	0.56	0-9.71	0.14	0.56
Mean educational level	1-3	2.16	0.43	1-3	2.15	0.42
<b>Micro-level control variables</b>						
Age	25-54	38.18	8.31	25-54	38.09	8.27
Duration of residence						
0-5 years	0/1	0.21	0.41	0/1	0.21	0.41
6-10 years	0/1	0.18	0.49	0/1	0.19	0.39
10+ years	0/1	0.61	0.49	0/1	0.60	0.49
Education						
Lower	0/1	0.29	0.45	0/1	0.32	0.47
Middle	0/1	0.41	0.49	0/1	0.40	0.49
High	0/1	0.30	0.46	0/1	0.28	0.45
Language proficiency						
Not fluent	0/1	0.20	0.40	0/1	0.18	0.38
Fluent	0/1	0.23	0.42	0/1	0.21	0.41
Unknown	0/1	0.58	0.49	0/1	0.61	0.49
<b>Macro-level control variables</b>						
Labor-force activity, native ref. (%)	88-96	93.71	1.42	50-89	71.22	11.40
Unemployment, native ref. (%)	1-17	6.56	3.69	1-30	10.35	6.16
Migration survey	0/1	0.07	0.26	0/1	0.04	0.19

*Note:* Descriptive statistics computed at the corresponding micro or macro level. The figures on destination variables refer to "destination per year" cases (see analysis and models).

**Table 3.** Percent Labor–Force Participation of Male Immigrants 25–54 Years of Age, Five Selected Origin Groups, in 18 Western Countries, 1980–2001

Destination	Country of origin					Mean, all groups	Mean, natives
	Germany	Italy	Morocco	Turkey	United Kingdom		
Australia	93.7	93.0	—	83.1	95.7	90.9	93.1
Austria	91.8	—	—	94.1	—	93.9	94.0
Belgium	91.6	85.9	84.2	79.5	—	86.6	93.5
Canada	95.7	92.1	—	—	95.9	91.0	92.9
Denmark	—	—	—	—	95.1	86.0	93.8
Finland	—	—	—	—	—	92.1	90.2
France	—	93.4	91.8	95.1	—	93.1	95.7
Germany	NA	96.7	—	95.4	—	95.8	95.0
Greece	—	—	—	—	—	97.5	94.6
Ireland	—	—	—	—	92.4	90.9	92.6
Italy	—	NA	98.2	—	—	97.9	92.9
Luxembourg	93.6	92.9	—	—	—	95.0	94.3
Netherlands	92.6	—	77.7	80.9	92.5	84.6	95.6
Portugal	—	—	—	—	—	92.3	93.7
Spain	—	—	94.5	—	—	92.5	93.0
Sweden	—	—	—	—	87.1	84.2	91.8
United Kingdom	93.6	—	—	—	NA	89.9	93.5
USA	94.4	94.6	—	—	94.9	90.5	92.4
Mean	92.8	91.1	85.6	86.7	93.4	90.9	93.5

*Note:* Figures on communities with fewer than 500 respondents not presented.

**Table 4.** Percent Labor–Force Participation of Female Immigrants 25–54 Years of Age, Five Selected Origin Groups, in 18 Western Countries, 1980–2001

Destination	Country of origin					Mean, all groups	Mean, natives
	Germany	Italy	Morocco	Turkey	United Kingdom		
Australia	—	48.8	—	—	60.5	58.5	57.2
Austria	72.2	—	—	55.7	—	72.3	77.1
Belgium	64.8	48.0	31.0	29.0	—	50.7	73.6
Canada	77.4	69.8	—	—	81.5	75.8	78.0
Denmark	—	—	—	—	—	70.2	86.1
Finland	—	—	—	—	—	75.2	85.9
France	—	—	40.5	—	—	57.4	81.1
Germany	NA	56.9	—	48.9	—	63.0	75.4
Greece	67.7	—	—	—	—	68.1	59.9
Ireland	—	—	—	—	60.4	60.8	58.6
Italy	—	NA	—	—	—	80.5	58.9
Luxembourg	53.0	50.5	—	—	—	63.2	56.6
Netherlands	73.3	—	32.8	38.9	—	58.9	74.6
Portugal	—	—	—	—	—	77.1	76.4
Spain	—	—	—	—	—	55.0	58.9
Sweden	—	—	—	—	—	73.5	87.8
United Kingdom	73.9	—	—	—	NA	62.6	76.6
USA	65.9	55.3	—	—	63.8	65.4	70.6
Mean	68.5	55.5	36.4	44.5	63.7	63.4	70.3

*Note:* Figures on communities with fewer than 500 respondents not presented.

**Table 5.** Percent of Active Employed Female Immigrants 25–54 Years of Age, Five Selected Origin Groups, in 18 Western Countries, 1980–2001

Destination	Country of origin					Mean, all groups	Mean, natives
	Germany	Italy	Morocco	Turkey	United Kingdom		
Australia	—	—	—	—	95.6	92.2	94.5
Austria	93.6	—	—	82.1	—	90.5	94.9
Belgium	85.5	73.7	54.5	—	—	77.3	89.7
Canada	92.5	91.5	—	—	94.4	90.5	91.6
Denmark	—	—	—	—	—	86.1	92.1
Finland	—	—	—	—	—	73.4	88.4
France	—	—	53.4	—	—	72.4	87.1
Germany	NA	—	—	86.1	—	86.2	89.9
Greece	—	—	—	—	—	82.1	85.8
Ireland	—	—	—	—	83.6	84.0	88.9
Italy	—	NA	—	—	—	79.4	80.5
Luxembourg	—	—	—	—	—	95.2	97.0
Netherlands	89.2	—	—	82.6	—	85.6	92.8
Portugal	—	—	—	—	—	93.0	95.3
Spain	—	—	—	—	—	81.8	76.4
Sweden	—	—	—	—	—	83.6	94.4
United Kingdom	93.0	—	—	—	NA	91.3	94.1
USA	94.2	—	—	—	96.1	92.8	94.8
Mean	91.0	86.2	63.7	78.8	88.5	88.7	92.7

*Note:* Figures on communities with fewer than 500 respondents not presented.

**SENSITIVITY ANALYSIS**

**Table 6.** Cross-Classified Multilevel Logistic Regression of Immigrants' Economic Incorporation in 18 Western Countries, 1980–2001: Specific Immigration Surveys Excluded

	Labor Force Activity				Employment			
	Males		Females		Males		Females	
	Model 1	Model 2	Model 3	Model 4	Model 1	Model 2	Model 3	Model 4
Constant	-5.839	-4.902	-1.622	-.827	3.096	3.419	3.510	2.190
Destination								
Point system	.070	-.045	.056	-.019	.028	-.305	.014	.121
Left-wing parties in government	.085**	.083**	.033**	.015	.091**	.090**	.098**	.108**
Origin								
Political suppression	-.039**	-.013	<b>-.003</b>	.003	-.068**	-.061**	-.074**	-.057**
Predominantly Christian origin	.448**	.595**	.281**	.297**	.004	.092	.222	.206*
Labor-force activity, females			.008**	.009**				
Community								
Gini ratio (origin/destination)	-.310**	-.686**	<b>-.140**</b>	-.046	-.463**	-.540**	-.923**	-.782**
GDP per capita ratio (origin/destination)	-.372**	-.435**	-.096*	-.131**	-.366**	-.374**	-.465**	-.456**
Geographic distance/1000 km	-.009**	-.014**	-.010**	-.011**	.032**	.028**	.029**	.024**
Official language	-.072	-.083*	.008	.048	.176**	.162**	.035	.014
Relative group size (%)	.036**	.023*	.063**	.054**	.022	.000	.033**	.019
Mean educational level, group	.073	-.132**	.327**	-.011	.491**	<b>.117</b>	.365**	.154*
Microlevel control variables								
Age		-.019**		-.016**		.006**		.013**
Duration of stay								
0-5 years		ref.		ref.		ref.		ref.
6-10 years		.734**		.395**		.350**		.439**
10+ years		.739**		.600**		.447**		.634**
Education								
Low		ref.		ref.		ref.		ref.
Middle		.475**		.482**		.314**		.307**
High		.677**		1.021**		.840**		.705**
Language proficiency								
Not fluent		ref.		ref.		ref.		ref.
Fluent		.260**		.079**		.213**		.323**
Unknown		.250		.197*		-.216		.168
Macrolevel control variables								
Migration survey (vs. general population survey)	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA
Labor-force activity (%), native ref. group	.092**	.086**	.021**	.013**				
Unemployment (%), native ref. group					-.130**	-.150**	-.080**	-.080**
Number of observations								
Destination year	121	121	120	120	121	121	120	120
Origin	182	182	175	175	179	179	168	168
Community	851	851	844	844	841	841	804	804
Individual	162,547	162,547	166,381	166,381	147,726	147,726	105,886	105,886

Note: Standard errors in parentheses. Findings that deviate from our conclusions, as summarized in Table 5 of the article, are printed in bold.

\*  $p < .05$ , \*\*  $p < .01$  (two-tailed tests).

**Table 7.** Cross-Classified Multilevel Logistic Regression of Immigrants' Economic Incorporation in 18 Western Countries, 1980–2001: Finland and Communities with Fewer than 50 Respondents Excluded

	Labor Force Activity				Employment			
	Males		Females		Males		Females	
	Model 1	Model 2	Model 3	Model 4	Model 1	Model 2	Model 3	Model 4
Constant	-4.832	-3.924	-1.267	-.291	2.604	2.186	2.874	1.704
Destination								
Point system	-.152	-.932**	.137	-.068	.071	.089	-.066	-.118
Left-wing parties in government	.081**	.081**	.023	<b>.039**</b>	.065**	.071**	.107**	.104**
Origin								
Political suppression	-.053**	-.053*	<b>-.015</b>	.004	-.049**	-.043**	-.063**	-.049**
Predominantly Christian origin	.341**	<b>.263</b>	.226*	.385**	.103	.186	.315**	.262**
Labor-force activity, females			.008**	.007**				
Community								
Gini ratio (origin / destination)	<b>-.205</b>	-.298**	-.045	-.095	<b>-.222</b>	-.392**	-.718**	-.542**
GDP per capita ratio (origin / destination)	-.426**	-.482**	-.123*	-.206**	-.261**	-.292**	-.445**	-.424**
Geographic distance (per 1000 km)	-.006	-.010*	-.007**	-.008**	.030**	.026**	.025**	.021**
Official language	.078	.081	.001	.032	.161**	.137**	.049	.042
Relative group size (%)	.039**	.028*	.060**	.052**	.021	.006	.044**	<b>.033*</b>
Mean educational level, group	.126*	-.066	.351**	-.018	.539**	.266**	.458**	.302**
Micro-level control variables								
Age		-.023**		-.016**		.006**		.013**
Duration of stay								
0–5 years		ref.		ref.		ref.		ref.
6–10 years		.492**		.377**		.361**		.447**
10+ years		.659**		.586**		.457**		.636**
Education								
Low		ref.		ref.		ref.		ref.
Middle		.492**		.485**		.330**		.306**
High		.659**		1.031**		.814**		.708**
Language proficiency								
Not fluent		ref.		ref.		ref.		ref.
Fluent		.246**		.108**		.295**		.318**
Unknown		-.145		-.120		.351**		-.109
Macro-level control variables								
Migration survey (versus general population survey)	.279**	-.091	-.446**	-.849**	-.354**	-.222	.252*	-.160
Labor-force activity (%), native ref. group	.081**	.079**	.017**	.012**				
Unemployment (%), native ref. group					-.130**	-.130**	-.080**	-.070**
Number of observations								
Destination year	122	122	122	122	122	122	122	122
Origin	127	127	124	124	124	124	124	124
Community	482	482	482	482	482	482	481	481
Individual	171,803	171,803	168,628	168,628	156,181	156,181	106,921	106,921

Note: Standard errors in parentheses. Findings that deviate from our conclusions, as summarized in Table 5 of the article, are printed in bold.

\*  $p < .05$ , \*\*  $p < .01$  (two-tailed tests).

**Table 8.** Cross-Classified Multilevel Logistic Regression of Immigrants' Economic Incorporation in 18 Western Countries, 1980–2001: Destinations Treated as Time Constant

	Labor Force Activity				Employment			
	Males		Females		Males		Females	
	Model 1	Model 2	Model 3	Model 4	Model 1	Model 2	Model 3	Model 4
Constant	-2.059	-5.535	-1.028	-1.008	3.401	1.715	2.771	1.132
<b>Destination</b>								
Point system	.026	-.674**	.209	-.056	-.387	.374*	.321	-.203
Government Left-wing parties	.011	.132**	.051	-.019	.012	<b>.105</b>	.118**	.140**
<b>Origin</b>								
Political suppression	-.057**	-.043**	-.021**	.003	-.060**	-.048**	-.076**	-.060**
Predominantly Christian origin	.491**	.444**	.271**	.253*	.180	-.173	.237*	.284**
Labor-force activity, females			.008**	.010**				
<b>Community</b>								
Gini ratio (origin / destination)	-.561**	-.536**	.127	.063	-.476**	-.411**	-.749**	-.760**
GDP per capita ratio (origin / destination)	-.576**	-.542**	-.173**	-.205**	-.309**	-.341**	-.550**	-.574**
Geographic distance (per 1000 km)	-.003	-.011**	-.008**	-.009**	.029**	.024**	.024**	.020**
Official language	-.092*	-.078	-.033	.065**	.168**	.160**	.020	.036
Relative group size (%)	.033**	.027*	.067**	.058**	.004	-.009	.037**	.015
Mean educational level, group	-.002	-.124*	.361**	-.012	.457**	.167**	.448**	.182**
<b>Micro-level control variables</b>								
Age		-.022**		-.016**		.007**		.013**
Duration of stay								
0-5 years		ref.		ref.		ref.		ref.
6-10 years		.724**		.381**		.373**		.425**
10+ years		.715**		.597**		.475**		.630**
Education								
Low		ref.		ref.		ref.		ref.
Middle		.468**		.478**		.364**		.319**
High		.623**		1.023**		.846**		.727**
Language proficiency								
Not fluent		ref.		ref.		ref.		ref.
Fluent		.247**		.118**		.282**		.300**
Unknown		-.742**		.597**		.680**		.331*
<b>Macro-level control variables</b>								
Migration survey (versus general population survey)	.011	-.695**	-.371**	-.169*	-.559**	-.060	.110	.237
Labor-force activity (%), native ref. group	.066**	.105**	.012**	.013**				
Unemployment (%), native ref. group					-.130**	-.113**	-.057*	-.020*
<b>Number of observations</b>								
Destination	18	18	18	18	18	18	18	18
Origin	187	187	187	187	183	183	178	178
Community	938	938	919	919	922	922	873	873
Individual	175,403	175,403	172,588	172,588	159,368	159,368	109,438	109,438

Note: Standard errors in parentheses. Findings that deviate from our conclusions, as summarized in Table 5 of the article, are printed in bold.

\*  $p < .05$ , \*\*  $p < .01$  (two-tailed tests).